

Confirmed Minutes of the Full Governing Body Meeting held on Tuesday 15th October 2019 at 6.00pm at the College



Present:

Mrs Kay Arrowsmith	Mr Michael Martin
Mr John Fogarty	Ms Tracy Mawson
Mr Mark Harvey	Mr Thomas Mitchell
Mr Mike Hill (<i>Principal</i>)	Mr Conal Neafcy
Mrs Susan Jarvis	Mrs Rebecca Papaspyridis
Mr Andrew Jones	Mr Andrew Rannard
Mr David Lawson	Rev Paul Rooney (<i>Chair</i>)
Mr Oliver Maddock	Mr Aiden Studdard

In attendance: Mr Karl Smith (*Vice Principal, Curriculum and Quality*)
Mrs Michelle Williams (*Vice Principal, Strategy & Resources*)
Mrs Catherine Shaw (*Clerk to Governors*)

A training session on 'Equality and Diversity' was delivered by Kate Moffatt (Equality and Diversity Co-ordinator). On behalf of the Board, the Chair thanked Mrs Moffatt for her informative presentation. The Vice Principal (Curriculum and Quality) commended the Equality and Diversity Co-ordinator on the excellent work that was undertaken by her.

The Equality and Diversity Co-ordinator left the meeting.

The Chair welcomed all attendees to the meeting and the meeting was opened in prayer.

1. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Governors were invited to declare whether they had any direct or indirect personal, prejudicial or pecuniary interest or conflict of interest in any matter which formed part of the agenda for this meeting or was likely to be discussed at the meeting.

Interests were declared as follows:

Agenda Item 7.1 – Principal's Report

- Summer Examination Results – Kay Arrowsmith
- Student Recruitment – Andrew Rannard
- Partnerships – Paul Rooney, Andrew Rannard and John Fogarty
- Analysis of Curriculum (including HE provision) – Susan Jarvis

Agenda Item: 8.1 – Student Voice

- Transport – John Fogarty

Agenda Item 12.6 – Search Committee Report

- Committee Membership - Oliver Maddock

2. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

2.1 None. All Governors were in attendance and the meeting was quorate.

3. **ITEMS FOR INCLUSION UNDER ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The following item was submitted by the Principal and **accepted** by the Board:

- Consultation on becoming a Smoke-Free Campus.

The Chair of Governors advised that due to time constraints the scheduled Search Committee meeting had not taken place and would be re-scheduled. Mr Oliver Maddock had expressed an interest in becoming a member of both the Remuneration and Search Committees and Board approval was sought.

Mr Maddock withdrew from the meeting.

The Board **approved** Mr Maddock's Membership to the Remuneration Committee and the Search Committee.

Mr Maddock returned to the meeting. He was thanked for his expression of interest and advised of subsequent Board approval.

4. GOVERNING BODY MINUTES (previously circulated)

- 4.1 The minutes of the Full Governing Body meeting held on 24th June 2019 were (a) approved and signed in accordance with Clause 12 (3) of the Articles of Government and (b) publication was authorised in accordance with Clause 13.

5. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE GOVERNING BODY MINUTES

- 5.1 **To consider any matters arising from the minutes (previously circulated)**

Minute 7.1 – Governing Body Self Assessment Working Group

In light of the outstanding Ofsted Inspection report earlier this year, the Board **agreed** to re-establish this Working Group in 2020/21 reflecting on the current academic year.

Minute 17.4 – Preparation for the Strategic Planning Day 2020

The Principal invited Governors to join the Corporate Management Team (CMT) on their Away Day at Liverpool Hope University on 16th December 2019. Mr Hill advised that CMT and middle managers were meeting with a view to strategic planning. The Principal informed the Board that the agenda was yet to be finalised. A discussion ensued.

The Board:

- **Agreed** to the Principal's proposal.
- **Requested** that the further information be circulated to Board Members at the earliest opportunity via the Clerk.
- **Noted** the associated action log.

Action: Principal and Clerk

Recommended for approval by the Quality and Standards Committee:

- 5.2 **10:10 Programme (enclosure)**

As Chair of the Quality and Standards Committee, Mr Martin provided an overview of the discussion that had taken place and the main areas of scrutiny. The Vice Principal (Strategy and Resources) confirmed that the requested change had taken place; namely to ensure this was being delivered as a single programme.

The Board accepted the recommendation made by the Quality and Standards Committee and **approved** the 10:10 Programme, in accordance with the requirements within the Instrument and Articles of Government.

6. ANNUAL REPORTS

- 6.1 **Audit Committee 2018/2019 (previously circulated)**

As Chair of the Audit Committee, Mr Jones advised the Board that this report had been fully considered at the Audit Committee meeting held on 1st October 2019. The statutory documentation was submitted to the Board with a recommendation for approval.

The Board **approved** the Audit Committee Annual Report for 2018/2019.

7. PRINCIPAL'S REPORT

7.1 To receive the Principal's Termly Report *(previously circulated)*

In addition to the Principal's Report which had previously been circulated, Mr Hill delivered a PowerPoint presentation (slides appended) highlighting the following aspects:

- College Priorities 2018/2019 – review of the progress made against the eight agreed priorities which were derived from strategic objectives.
- College Priorities 2019/2020 – outline of nine priorities and their link with the College's strategic aims.
- Summer Examinations Results 2019 – as the national picture had developed it was evident that Carmel had achieved excellent results.
- Underperforming subject areas – the summer examination results in 2019 confirmed that significant progress had been made in the minority of subjects where underperformance in 2018 had been identified.
- Student Recruitment in September 2019 – under recruitment by approximately seventy students. For census purposes student numbers would crystallise on 18th October 2019. The new cycle of liaison and recruitment was taking place for September 2020 with the implementation of a more centralised strategy.
- Curriculum 2019/2020 – Subjects that had been removed from Carmel's offer, together with the Salford University Graphics course. There had been growth in HE recruitment at the College.
- College Ethos – Events included: a 'Welcome to Carmel Parents' Information evening in September 2019, the College Chaplain had led welcome services for all of the Lower Sixth students, the 10:10 Programme was being delivered as approved by the Full Governing Body, a Freshers Fair had taken place and also a successful Macmillan Charity Coffee morning.
- Partnership Work – encompassed both college and school improvement work. Opportunities for 2019/2020 included the formation of a 'College A Level Subject Excellence Network' by Carmel. The College continued to be pivotal within the Archdiocese of Liverpool Secondary School Improvement Trust. The Principal continued to lead on an Archdiocesan project offering Sixth Form College reviews and the College received an income for each completed review.
- Challenges for 2019/2020 – funding pressure remained a key area, taking into account factors such as pay rises and increased employer contributions to the Teachers' Pension scheme.
- Association of Catholic Sixth Form Colleges (ACVIC) Conference October 2019 – attended by the Principal and Chair of Governors. Update provided.

A discussion ensued with several questions being raised by Governors, which were responded to by the Principal. These included:

Q. What do you believe to be the reasons for not achieving the student recruitment target?

A. A survey was carried across approximately 150 students who had applied to Carmel but enrolled elsewhere. In response, the main reasons were the distance from home to Carmel and transport issues. One neighbouring College offers free bus passes. Manchester City Region provide free student bus passes via the 'Our Pass' initiative; this is likely to adversely affect Carmel's recruitment from some areas in Wigan.

Q. What is included in the centralised recruitment strategy this year, as referenced in the report?

A. A full time Liaison Officer and a dedicated liaison email address. Some 11-18 schools are closing their sixth form provision and Carmel is being promoted as the sixth form

provider of choice. We have developed smarter and more effective working practices.

Q. When courses are withdrawn, how is this managed?

A. All courses run to completion with none being withdrawn part way through. Courses have been withdrawn where a three year decline in student recruitment has been evident.

Q. Has the withdrawal of any courses impacted on recruitment?

A. No, partly because there are now reduced options available in secondary schools.

Q. Has Management seen an increase in student recruitment from St Peter and St Paul's School in Widnes, since the closure of its sixth form provision?

A. Yes, by 16 students.

The Board:

- **noted** the contents of the Principal's Report.
- **requested** clarification on the percentage of students who had achieved A*-C / D*-M in the overall Level 3 results and the comparative date for 2018.
- **placed on record** their appreciation to all staff who were working after the College day to support bespoke events such as the Open Evenings.

Action: Principal – Future Agenda Item

On behalf of the Board, the Chair thanked the Principal for his Termly Report.

The Chair welcomed Mr Studdard to his first full Governing Body meeting and invited him to present agenda item 8.1

8. STUDENT VOICE

8.1 Update from the Student Governor (previously circulated)

Mr Studdard presented this report and highlighted the key areas that the Student Council (SC) in 2019/2020 would be focussing on, namely:

- Fundraising Initiatives – charities included Stonewall and the Gambia Water Project.
- Road Safety – this remained an on-going concern identified by previous Student Councils. The main concern related to the area immediately outside of College on Prescott Road.
- Social Media – improved communication with the student body and to advertise College events via various social media platforms.
- Transport – Dissatisfaction with current transportation links to College and the infrequency of services operated by two public bus providers. This issue was raised by the SC directly with Steve Rotheram (Liverpool City Region Metro Mayor) at the 'Speak to Steve' event which took place at the College on 7th October 2019. In addition to this, a meeting had been arranged for the Student Council to present their concerns to several St Helens Councillors.

A discussion ensued, with numerous questions being asked and responded to by the Student Governor.

The Board:

- **noted** the report.
- **confirmed** its commitment to support the Student Council (SC) in its efforts to address the road safety concerns and suggested the SC also contact Jane Kennedy, Merseyside and Police Commissioner about this issue.

- **requested** that all Board Members were furnished with details relating to the various social media platforms used by both the College and the Student Council.

Action: Clerk

On behalf of the Board, the Chair thanked Mr Studdard for his very informative report and wished the SC well with their endeavours.

9. FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

9.1 Financial Update: Year End Account 2018/2019 *(previously circulated)*

The Vice Principal (Strategy and Resources) provided an overview of the financial performance of the College for the year ended 31st July 2019. Mrs Williams advised that the accounts were considered by the Finance and Resources Committee at its meeting on 26th September 2019. The accounts were unaudited and as such were subject to change. The Financial Statements were to be presented for approval at the next full Governing Body meeting scheduled to take place on 10th December 2019.

As Chair of the Finance and Resources Committee, Mr Fogarty reported that the Committee had monitored the outturn throughout the 2018/2019 year and it was evident from the year-end interim account that Management reports had proved to be consistent. He advised that the College had no direct control over the pension data relating to the FRS 17 reporting requirements and its subsequent adverse impact on the deficit budget.

The Board **noted** the report.

9.2 Correspondence from the Education and Skills Funding Agency (ESFA) *(previously circulated)*

The letter sent to all Chairs of Governors at Further Education (FE) Colleges and Sixth Form Colleges (SFC) from Eileen Milner (Chief Executive, ESFA) in July 2019 was considered by the Committee. The correspondence related to the outcomes from an investigation that was undertaken at Bournville College in 2015/2016. Several recommendations had been included aimed at ensuring oversight of the proper use of public funds by college governing bodies. The letter and recommendations were duly considered by the Board.

Following a discussion, the Board:

- **noted** the contents of the report
- **approved** that the ESFA recommendations were to be implemented and monitored in the first instance via the appropriate Committee, with the exception of the adoption of the College's Senior Staff Remuneration Code developed by the Association of Colleges (AoC).

Action: Clerk

10. GOVERNING BODY REVIEW

10.1 Annual Review of Eligibility and Declarations of Interest *(verbal report)*

The Clerk referred to the statutory requirement to maintain a Register of Interests. Mrs Shaw confirmed that all documentation had now been received and thanked Governors for their timely responses to this request.

The Board **noted** this report.

11. POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

11.1 **Complaints made against the Governing Body, Board Members and Clerk** *(previously circulated)*

The Clerk provided an overview of this policy and the relatively minor amendments that were being recommended.

Following due consideration the Board **approved** this Policy.

11.2 **Safeguarding and Child Protection Policy** *(previously circulated)*

The Vice Principal (Strategy and Resources) provided details relating to the suggested amendments to this policy since its last approval.

The Board **approved** the Safeguarding and Child Protection Policy.

11.3 **Risk Policy** *(previously circulated)*

As Chair of the Audit Committee, Mr Jones reported that this had been considered in full at Audit Committee meeting held on 1st October 2019. Mr Jones advised that it was a comprehensive policy and highlighted the clear organisation chart on page 5. It was submitted to the Board with a recommendation for approval.

The Board accepted the recommendation made by the Audit Committee and **approved** the Risk Policy.

12. COMMITTEE MEETINGS

To receive the following draft minutes:

12.1 **Quality and Standards Committee Meeting held on 24th September 2019** *(previously circulated)*

As Chair of the Quality and Standards Committee, Mr Martin presented an overview of this meeting. In particular he drew the Board's attention to:

- Summer examination results which had also been presented earlier at this meeting. Whilst results were noted to be excellent, one subject area had presented cause for concern. However, it had since transpired that other colleges have had a similar experience relating to the same subject. In response, the Vice Principal (Curriculum and Quality) advised that this matter had been escalated to OFQUAL.
- A safeguarding update had been discussed and noted.
- 10:10 Programme – the Board had accepted the Committee's recommendation to approve this programme within agenda item 5.2.
- Annual Staff Climate Survey – whilst accepted and noted, it was requested that future reports were to be presented in a different format.

The Board **received** the draft minutes from the Quality and Standards Committee meeting.

12.2 **Quality and Standards Committee Meeting held on 24th September 2019 – confidential section** *(previously circulated)*

The Board:

- **received** the draft confidential minutes from the Quality and Standards Committee meeting.
- **requested** that retention data from Lower Sixth to Upper Sixth in one of the science subject areas was to be reported at the next meeting.

Action: Corporate Management Team – Future Agenda Item

12.3 **Finance and Resources Committee Meeting held on 26th September 2019** *(previously circulated)*

As Chair of Finance and Resources, Mr Fogarty presented an overview of this meeting. In particular he drew the Board's attention to:

- the adverse impact on the approved budget, as a consequence of student under recruitment in September 2019. Reference was made to the sensitivity analysis that was presented by Management in June 2019.
- the requested costs/benefits analyses within the minutes.

A discussion ensued with a focus on both the deficit budget and student transportation issues; the latter being linked to the Student Voice report within agenda item 8.1. Whilst Mr Fogarty had declared an interest in student transport, he assisted the Board by clarifying the position in general terms since deregulation and subsequent privatisation of bus services.

The Board **received** the draft minutes from the Finance and Resources Committee meeting.

12.4 Finance and Resources Committee Meeting held on 24th September 2019 – confidential section (previously circulated)

The Board **received** the draft confidential minutes from the Finance and Resources Committee meeting.

12.5 Audit Committee Meeting held on 1st October 2019 (previously circulated)

As Chair of the Audit Committee, Mr Jones presented an overview of this meeting. In addition to the Audit Committee Annual Report and the Risk Management Policy which were addressed earlier in this meeting, Mr Jones reported on the following:

- a very informative presentation had been delivered by the newly appointed Internal Auditors.
- the internal audit assignments for 2019/2020 had been approved.
- Management reports had been presented with a clear focus on three key areas of risk which required close monitoring.

The Board **received** the draft minutes from the Audit Committee meeting.

To receive the following verbal report:

12.6 Search Committee Meeting held on 15th October 2019

The Chair advised that due to the earlier Remuneration Meeting overrunning in terms of time, the subsequent Search Committee Meeting had not taken place and would be re-scheduled.

13. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

13.1 Proposed Consultation on becoming a Smoke-Free Campus

The Principal advised that the CMT was reviewing the current provision of a smoking shelter within the College's outside grounds. It was the CMT's suggestion to launch a consultation exercise with a proposal to become a no smoking / vaping College.

A discussion ensued. This included potential adverse effects for neighbouring residents should the campus become no smoking / vaping.

Following due consideration, the Board **supported** the CMT's proposal to enter into a consultation process with key stakeholders on this issue.

14. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

14.1 Full Governing Body Meeting – Tuesday 10th December 2019 at 6.00pm.

Given the confidential nature of Agenda Item 15 the Principal, Staff Governor, Student Governor, Vice Principal (Strategy and Resources) and Vice Principal (Curriculum and Quality) were thanked for their attendance and they left the meeting at this point.

15. CONFIDENTIAL GOVERNING BODY MINUTES

15.1 Approval of the confidential section of the minutes of the Full Governing Body Meeting held on 24th June 2019 (previously circulated)

The Board **approved** the confidential minutes of the Full Governing Body Meeting held on 24th June 2019.

15.2 To consider any matters arising from the minutes

This agenda item was deemed confidential for the purposes of the minutes and was addressed in conjunction with agenda item 16.1

16. REMUNERATION COMMITTEE

16.1 To receive a confidential verbal report from the Remuneration Committee Meeting held on 15th October 2019

This item was deemed confidential for the purposes of the minutes.

Mr Fogarty gave his apologies and left the meeting during agenda item 16.1. The Clerk withdrew from the meeting during agenda item 16.1 in accordance with the Instrument and Articles of Government, with minutes being taken in her absence.

The Chair thanked Governors for their attendance and contribution at the meeting. There being no further business to discuss the meeting was closed at 8.35pm.

Signed by the Chair: College File signed by Rev Paul Rooney-----

On this day: 10th December 2019-----