

Minutes of the Full Governing Body Committee Meeting Held on Tuesday, 11 March, 2008 at 7.00 pm

Present: Mr Peter Alcock
Ms Kath Boullen
Mr Brian Coxhead (Vice Chair)
Mr Gerry Hill
Mr Rod Hill (Chair)
Dr John Humphreys
Mr Donal McCormack
Mr Mike Nencini
Mr Rob Peacock
Mr Karl Smith
Mrs Helen Stevenson
Dr Christine Tyler

Observer: Mrs Margaret Buckley

College Personnel: Mr Nick Burnham, (Vice Principal)
Mrs Michelle Williams, (Director of Resources)
Mr Colin Williams, (Project Sponsor)

Mr John Perry (Clerk)
Mrs Alison Fishwick (Minuting Clerk)

Mr Richard Wise, (Architect) Ryders for Agenda Item 6

1. **Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

2. **Apologies**

Apologies for absence were received from Mr John Fogarty, Fr Paul Glover, Mr John Cotter, Fr Felix Stephens and Canon Leo Stoker.

3. **Minutes of the Meeting of 10th December, 2007**

The Minutes were agreed to be a correct record and signed by the Chair.

4. **Matters Arising**

Agenda Item 4 Matters Arising Item 8 – Telephone Masts

The Director of Resources reported that written notice has now been presented to Orange to withdraw from site. The contract for T Mobile, which generates an annual rental income of £2,800, has another six years to run and the company have requested re-location fees of around £80/£90K. Governors noted that this will need to be paid once C Block has been demolished. The Director of Resources added that a breakdown of the re-location costs has been requested of T Mobile and Governors will be kept informed of developments. Governors noted that legal advice on this matter has been sought.

Agenda Item 4 Matters Arising Item 9 – Amnesty International

Governors noted that, despite a further letter from the Principal to Amnesty International, there has still been no response.

Agenda Item 5 – Framework for Excellence

The Chair asked whether this initiative had any impact on staff workload. The Vice Principal responded that the pilot has not been too onerous in respect of staffing issues. The Director of Resources added that the audit part of the review was the most onerous task. The College is now waiting for the final grading.

The Principal reported on the success of David Bell's visit on 8 February. David Bell, Permanent Secretary at the Department for Innovation, Universities & Standards, who was shadowed on the day by Oona Stannard from the CES, met students from the Essential Skills, Advanced Courses and Gifted and Talented cohorts. He also met with two other SFC Principals where issues were openly discussed.

Agenda Item 6 – The Concordat with Partner Schools

The Principal tabled draft Performance Indicators, as requested at the previous meeting, for collaborative arrangements between partner high schools and Carmel College. These were considered by the Governors. Governors were happy with the Performance Indicators as tabled but asked that the Performance Indicators should also measure the success rate of partner school recruitment which, in view of the proposed build, will be crucial over the next few years. The College was asked to establish Carmel's share of partner school recruitment and set an appropriate target.

5. Report of the Governors' Strategic Planning Day, 19th January, 2008

The Clerk explained that the report summarises the presentations of the three inputs. Appendix 5 of the report creates a set of questions for Governors to consider.

Overall Governors found the day extremely useful and in order to continue the momentum requested that a report be prepared for the next Full Governing Body meeting in June detailing actions on the points raised during the day. These action points will be referred back to the Search Committee in order to consider the issues of governance and make further recommendations.

Governors resolved:

(i) To note the Report

(ii) To approve the recommendation of the Search Committee to hold a Strategic Planning Day in 2009

(iii) To request a further report on action taken over points raised in discussion on the day.

6. The Accommodation Strategy

Richard Wise of Ryders presented the updated project design of both Phase 1 and Phase 2 showing the planned phasing of the development. Governors also viewed a fly-through presentation.

The Chair reported that at the recent Accommodation Working Party a number of issues were discussed in respect of the design. For example, Governors were concerned about the amount of glass being used as it was felt that this would cause glare and there was some concern about noise levels. The Chair reported that solutions to these issues were currently being considered. There were also some concerns regarding parking although there was assurance that there would be no worsening of the problem with the new build. However, the Chair reassured Governors that the College will be provided with a quality scheme. The Student Council had also viewed the designs and were very positive about the scheme.

Richard Wise was thanked for his presentation and for attending.

The Principal then took Governors through his report which outlined in detail the progress on the development of both phases one and two. The paper was read in conjunction with other papers previously circulated to Governors, namely the Application in Detail for Phase 1, the Application in Principle for Phase 2, Minutes of the Finance Committee of 22 February and the verbal report from the Chair on the Minutes of the Accommodation Working Party of 4 March, 2008. AA Projects, the Project Managers, had also circulated a report on the current progress.

On page 3 of the Report Para 10, noted that word "received" should read "perceived".

Page 3, paragraph 8, Governors noted that the confirmed date for the interviews for Contractors is Tuesday, 25 March.

Page 4, paragraph 14, Governors noted the proposal to shorten the construction period by 12 months and the anticipated reduction costs.

Page 4, paragraph 19, Governors noted that the LSC would be comfortable with an overall cost of £22.2m and that to-date Kier NW have provided a cost plan of £22.5m.

Page 4, paragraph 21, Governors noted that the Property Advisor now understands the scheme better and realises that Build 1 and 2 are attached and is much more comfortable with the approach.

Page 5, paragraph 26, Governors noted the opportunity to purchase 8 high quality temporary classrooms and that it would cost approximately £80k to transport them and erect them on site. These costs have been raised with contractors who have agreed to absorb the costs. However, as the mobiles need to be moved by end of March/April this would be "at risk" expenditure for the College.

In respect of Phase 2, the Principal reported that tenders will be invited for the RIBA Stage D of Phase 2.

After Governors considered the Principal's report, the Chair commented that the Finance, Estates and Marketing Committee felt that the scheme was still affordable and that a special meeting of the Governing Board will be arranged some time after the LSC meeting on the 21 May. The Chair asked Governors whether there were any concerns at this stage.

Governors asked whether the College had considered worst case scenarios and how the College will address them. The Director of Resources responded that a Risk Analysis had taken place and tabled an assessment of college risk mitigation measures which Governors had requested at the Finance, Estates & Marketing Governing Body meeting. Governors noted that the data should be read in conjunction with the financial commentary supporting the AiD and confirmed that the college management team will take action to deal with whatever risk the College is confronted with.

Governors asked for reassurance that once the LSC have granted approval for the final cost of the Phase 1 programme that these costs are 'set in concrete'. The College confirmed that this would be the case and there would be no further changes to the project costs.

Governors asked whether there was confidence in the remaining two contractors. The Director of Resources responded that both companies submitted financial statements for the last three years and credit checks have taken place. References from other sites have also been received for both companies. There was general disappointment that there were only two companies in the final stage. The Principal reminded Governors about the extent of building projects currently taking place up and down the country.

After careful consideration of the information presented Governors:

1. **Noted the contents of the Report.**
2. **Approved the design of Phase 1 of the project as part of an Application in Detail to the LSC for funds.**
3. **Approved the request to the LSC, in the form of the Application in Detail, for financial support for phase one of the project as follows:**
 - **Maximum cost of the project** £24,479,320
 - **LSC contribution** £18,114,697 (74%)
 - **College borrowing** £4,100,000
 - **College contribution from reserves** £2,264,623
4. **Approved an application to for borrowing of £4,100,000.**
5. **Approved the adoption of a shortened programme for phase one as the preferred option.**
6. **Agreed to offer support providing representatives to interview contractors during the week commencing 25th March, 2008.**
7. **Approved the design of stage two as part of an Application in Principle to the LSC for financial support.**
8. **Approved the request to the LSC, in the form of the Application in Principle, for financial support which meets LSC requirements which is currently £6.8m (100%)**
9. **Authorised the Accommodation Working Party to approve final amendments to both the AiD and the AiP.**
10. **Approved the purchase of temporary accommodation taking into account the transport and erection costs which will be an 'at risk' cost for the college until contractors are appointed.**

The date for a special meeting of the Full Governing Body will be held on Thursday, 22 May at 7.00 pm. The purpose of the meeting is to give final approval to the project pending receipt of approval from the LSC via letter on the 22 May.

7. Risk Management

Governors noted that CMT has reviewed the Risk Register and Risk Management Action Plan in line with College Policy and amendments were made and approved:

1. The status of the risk of losing key IT staff has been raised to 'significant'.
2. The objective of achieving compliance with estates related legislation has a further control of the appointment of new estates manager with operational responsibility for Health & Safety.

Governors noted the changes to the Action Plan.

8. Whole College Self Assessment Report (SAR) 2007

The Vice Principal thanked those Governors who gave their support during the 2007 self assessment process.

The college's Self Assessment process has been identified as an example of outstanding practice and as such is being highlighted by Ofsted as part of their *Capacity to Improve* website. Governors noted that Carmel will be presenting a session on the self-assessment process at the ACVIC Conference, the Principal added that whilst putting the material together they identified that the difference with Carmel's process is the investment of time, right down to subject level; knowing the strengths and weaknesses of every subject and the involvement of the Head of Department. Indeed, because of the robustness of the process, internal inspections are no longer carried out and these have been replaced by departmental reviews. The Vice Principal added that the College is much happier with the SAR process moving to the Autumn Term post September Reviews, although it does make the Autumn Term extremely busy.

The Vice Principal referred to one area graded as 4 (inadequate) and reported that robust actions are in the process of taking place to address this.

The Chair remarked that the report is very good and felt reassured that the College were able to successfully instigate remedial actions to address subject areas which were a cause for concern.

Governors noted the contents of the report.

**9. Report of the Search Committee, 11th March, 2008 Verbal Report
Appointment of a new Foundation Governor**

Margaret Buckley left the meeting for this Agenda Item.

The Clerk reported that the Search Committee had met that evening and agreed to commend to the governors that the Board recommends to the Trustees of the Archdiocese that Mrs Margaret Buckley is appointed as a Foundation Governor from 1st. April 2008. Governors welcomed this recommendation.

Governors approved the recommendation to the Trustees of the Archdiocese to appoint Mrs Margaret Buckley's as Foundation Governor from 1st. April 2008.

Margaret Buckley rejoined the meeting

10. Report of the Personnel & Quality Assurance Committee, 5th February, 2008

Governors noted the key issues arising from the Committee meeting.

11. Report of the Finance, Estates & Marketing Committee, 22nd February, 2008

Governors noted the key issues arising from the Committee meeting.

12. Report of the Audit Committee, 4th March, 2008

Governors noted the key issues arising from the Committee meeting.

13. Any Other Business

(a) Attendance of Student Governor – There was concern about the attendance record of the Student Governor, although it was understood that

there were genuine reasons for not being able to attend meetings. Governors asked whether the College could appoint two in the future. The Clerk explained that the Governing Body is still operating under the old Instrument and Articles. The DIUS had informed the Clerk that the College's new Instrument & Articles should be available before 1st September 2008 and they may contain a requirement to have two student governors. The Clerk agreed to approach the Teacher Student Council Representative to suggest having two students attend next year, either as two student governors or as one Student Governor and one deputy, to ensure better attendance and representation. Dr Christine Tyler offered to mentor the Student Governor and deputy.

(b) Mr J Cotter

The Chair is to write to Mr John Cotter who is standing down as Foundation Governor to thank him for his services to the Governing Body over 8 years and to wish him well for the future.

(c) St Helens Chamber of Commerce

The Chair took the opportunity of congratulating Ms Kath Boullen, Chief Executive of the St Helens Chamber of Commerce, for achieving 'Chamber of the Year' for St. Helens Chamber.

14. Dates of Next Meetings-

22nd May 2008
24th June 2008

The meeting ended at 8.50 pm.

Signed on this day:

By the Chair: